



October 30, 2017

Caltrans, District 4
Attn: Melissa Coppola, Associate Environmental Planner
111 Grand Avenue, MS 8B
Oakland, CA 94612
Oakland.Alameda.Access@dot.ca.gov
(510) 286-4736

Dear Melissa Coppola,

Thank you for the opportunity to comment on the Oakland Alameda Access Project (<https://www.alamedactc.org/oakland-alamedaproject>). We are excited to see a forward thinking project that aims to improve pedestrian and bicycle connectivity within Oakland as well as to and from Alameda. We are happy to see the proposal to remove the Broadway offramp, thereby reducing the barrier effect of I-880. However, we do have concerns about the impacts on the Posey Tube, which is Oakland Landmark #110, a major contributor to the Waterfront Warehouse National Register District, individually eligible for the National Register, and a cultural resource under CEQA.

- 1) An alternative must be studied which does not impact the exit walls or portal stairs of the Oakland Portal of the Posey Tube. These walls are character defining as they fit within the symmetric vocabulary of the portal. This project proposes to disrupt this symmetry, which negatively impacts its character. The Oakland side of the tube has already been greatly disturbed due to the construction of I-880, and an alternative should be created that avoids further impacts to its historic integrity.
- 2) We would like to see this project come to Oakland's Landmarks Board for comments. Input from the City of Oakland as well as wider participation will lead to a better outcome for Oakland and Alameda residents. Limiting the scoping to a single public meeting does not allow all voices to be heard. Holding a meeting with the Oakland Landmarks Board would also allow Caltrans to align and collaborate with the City of Oakland on treatment of this important resource.
- 3) We would like to see a historic resource evaluation that determines the impacts of removal of the exit wall, the portal stairs, and the railing. Given that the portal is an Oakland Landmark, eligible for the National Register, and a contributor to a National Register District, the proposed changes must not be taken lightly. The Waterfront Warehouse District National Register form describes the Oakland Portal as a "prime contributor to the District" and we would not want this project to impact the District's status, nor the building's eligibility for the National Register. Please study how this

project would impact the Waterfront Waterhouse's National Historic District Status as well as the Tube's own eligibility for the National Register.

- 4) We would like to see detailed existing and proposed renderings that make clear the changes to the Posey Tube's historic elements. These renderings would help us as well as the public understand and evaluate more specifically what the proposed changes are.

Thank you for the opportunity to comment on this project. We look forward to our comments being addressed. If you have any questions about our comments, please contact Daniel Levy at 510-289-4699 or at dlouislevy@gmail.com. Please add us to your list of contacts when issuing updates to this project.

Sincerely,



Alison Finlay
President
Oakland Heritage Alliance

cc:

William Gilchrist (WGilchrist@oaklandnet.com)

Robert Merkamp (RMerkamp@oaklandnet.com)

Matt Weintraub (MWeintraub@oaklandnet.com)

Betty Marvin (BMarvin@oaklandnet.com)

City of Oakland Landmarks Board

chrisandrews@sbcglobal.net

pbirkholz@gmail.com

stafford@garden-restoration.com

nenna08@gmail.com

klara@ktarch.com

vincexsugrue@gmail.com